COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY KENTUCKY BOARD OF TAX APPEALS FILE NO. K04-S-130

HOWARD AND VIRGINIA LAMBERT

APPELLANTS

V. ORDER NO. K-19337

ROWAN COUNTY PROPERTY VALUATION ADMINISTRATOR

APPELLEE

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals has delegated authority to a hearing officer pursuant to KRS 13B.030. The hearing officer entered a recommended order in compliance with the provision of KRS 13B.110. The Appellant filed exceptions to the recommended order. The Board has reviewed the record, the recommended order and the exceptions.

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals conducted a hearing in this matter on January 5, 2005 and makes the following findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommended disposition.

FINDINGS OF FACT

This assessment appeal is for real property located at 111 Fallen Timber Hollow, Clearfield, Kentucky. The Rowan County Property Valuation Administrator assessed the property at \$29,340.00. The taxpayer or Appellant values the property at no value. The Rowan County Board of Assessment Appeals valued the property at \$2,284.00. The Appellants filed a timely appeal from the local board with the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals.

The Appellants offered the following evidence in support of their appeal:

Howard Lambert appeared as the witness for the Appellants and provided sworn testimony in support of re-classification of the property they bought in 1985. The Rowan

County Property Valuation Administrator assessed the property for the year 2004 at \$29,340.00 and the Appellants appeared before the Rowan County Board of Assessment Appeals and were granted the re-classification of property in question to agriculture value, which was set at \$2,284.00. The Appellants accepted the re-classification but did not understand why the property in question was classified as residential in past years. They were advised that this appeal was for the year 2004 and previous years could not be discussed.

The PVA argues that the land in question was assessed as residential property at a fair case value of \$29,240.00.

It is the finding of this hearing that the Appellants did not sustain their burden of proof regarding their challenge to the final order of the Rowan County Board of Assessment Appeals

Based upon the evidence in the record, it is the finding of hearing officer, Randall Phillips, that the fair cash value of the property in question as of January 1, 2004 is \$2,284.00 agricultural value.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals is vested with exclusive jurisdiction to hear and determine appeals from final rulings, orders and determinations of the Rowan County Board of Assessment Appeals pursuant to KRS 131.340(1).

The function of the Board is not simply to review the action of the Rowan County Board of Assessment Appeals, but to try anew the issues as presented. *Jefferson County Property Valuation Administrator v. Oxford Properties, Inc.*, Ky.App., 726 S.W.2d 317, 319 (1987). See KRS 131.340(1).

Section 172 of the Kentucky Constitution mandates that "all property shall be assessed for taxation at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring a fair voluntary sale."

The choice of the most appropriate and reliable approach to valuation is within the prerogative of the Board. *Jefferson County Property Valuation Administrator*, 726 S.W.2d at 319.

Regardless of the manner or method used by the Property Valuation Administrator or the decision of the Kentucky Tax Board of Appeals, the finding of valuation must be at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale. *Helman v. Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals*, Ky.App., 554 S.W.2d 889 (1977).

As the party proposing that the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals set aside the decision of the Rowan County Board of Assessment Appeals, the Appellants have the burden of proving a lower value. KRS 13B.090(7).

If the property is sold at or near the assessment date in a fair and voluntary sale, the sale price is usually the best evidence of the property's fair cash value. *Sears, Roebuck & Company* v. *Boone County Board of Assessment Appeals*, Ky.App., 715 S.W.2d 888, 889 (1986).

Based upon the facts as established in this hearing, the hearing officer concludes that the fair cash value of the subject property as of January 1, 2004 is \$2,284.00.

RECOMMENDED ORDER

It is recommended that the August 13, 2004 final ruling of the Rowan County Board of Assessment Appeals be sustained and the real property be assessed at a fair cash value of \$2,284.00 as of January 1, 2004.

Each party shall have fifteen (15) days from the date any recommended order is mailed within which to file exceptions to the recommendations with the agency head. Transmittal of a recommended order may be sent by regular mail to the last known address of the party.

FINAL ORDER

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals has considered the record and the exceptions filed and accepts the recommended order of the hearing officer, and adopts it as the Board's final order. Failure to file exceptions to an administrative hearing officer's recommendations after a hearing constitutes a failure to exhaust administrative remedies and precludes appellate review. *Swatzell v. Natural Resources and Environmental Protection Cabinet*, Ky App 962 SW 2nd 866 (1998).

The August 13, 2004 final ruling of the Rowan County Board of Assessment Appeals is sustained and the real property is to be assessed at a fair cash value of \$2,284.00 as of January 1, 2004.

The following information is provided pursuant to the final order requirements of KRS Chapter 13B:

This is a final and appealable order. All final orders of this agency shall be subject to judicial review in accordance with the provisions of KRS Chapter 13B. A party shall institute an appeal by filing a petition in the Circuit Court of venue, as provided in the agency's enabling statutes, within thirty (30) days after the final order of the agency is mailed or delivered by personal service. If venue for appeal is not stated in the enabling statutes, a party may appeal to Franklin Circuit Court or the Circuit Court of the county in which the appealing party resides or operates a place of business. Copies of the petition shall be served by the petitioner upon the

agency and all parties of record. The petition shall include the names and addresses of all parties

to the proceeding and the agency involved, and a statement of the grounds on which the review is

requested. The petition shall be accompanied by a copy of the final order.

A party may file a petition for judicial review only after the party has exhausted all

administrative remedies available within the agency whose action is being challenged, and

within any other agency authorized to exercise administrative review.

A petition for judicial review shall not automatically stay a final order pending the

outcome of the review, unless:

(a) An automatic stay is provided by statute upon appeal or at any point in the

administrative proceedings;

A stay is permitted by the agency and granted upon request; or (b)

(c) A stay is ordered by the Circuit Court of jurisdiction upon petition.

Within twenty (20) days after service of the petition of appeal, or within further time

allowed by the Circuit Court, the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals shall transmit to the reviewing

court the original or a certified copy of the official record of the proceeding under review in

compliance with KRS 13B.140(3).

DATE OF ORDER

AND MAILING: May 24, 2005

FULL BOARD CONCURRING.

NANCY MITCHELL

CHAIR

- 5 -